The Direct Support Workforce: A crisis or serious systems flaw?

5.25.18
Sponsored by Nisonger Institute, Columbus OH

on community living
Person. Family. Community.

CONTEXT IS EVERYTHING
LTSS in a single word - UNCERTAINTY

- Healthcare reform
- HCBS Settings Rule
- DOJ litigation and settlement agreements
- Managed care
- Budget implications of growth in demand and shrinking wage earners
- Individualized supports
Advocacy and increased expectations
ID/DD expenditures over time, 1977–2015

*In 2015 dollars
Estimated LTSS Recipients per 100,000 of the Population by State and Setting Type in Fiscal Year 2016
Per person Medicaid expenditures by age and setting in the U.S. and Ohio

For US, 51 (50 states and the District of Columbia) reported data, RISP FY 2016
Per Capita Investment in People with IDD FY 2016

People with IDD Receiving Funded Supports and Services

- United States
- Ohio

Long Term Supports and Service Recipients per 100,000:
- United States: 380
- Ohio: 908

Medicaid Recipients ICF/IID and IDD Waiver per 100,000:
- United States: 273
- Ohio: 370

Expenditures per capita (Medicaid ICF/IID and IDD Waiver):
- United States: $142
- Ohio: $194

Medicaid Funding provided to people with IDD provided per state resident
People With IDD Waiting for Services…

% is the amount of growth needed to serve those waiting.

From 2010 on, people waiting may include people waiting for residential services in addition to the Medicaid Waiver. In 2015-16 people waiting were those waiting in the family home for Waiver Services.
Quality of services and support that promote community living

OUTCOMES
National Quality Forum (NQF) framework

11 Domains
2-7 Subdomains

Consumer Leadership in System Development
Choice and Control
Human and Legal Rights
Community Inclusion
Holistic Health and Functioning
Workforce
Caregiver Support
Person-Centered Service Planning and Coordination
Service Delivery & Effectiveness
System Performance & Accountability
Equity
NQF HCBS Domains and Subdomains

Human and Legal Rights
- Freedom from abuse and neglect
- Informed decision-making
- Optimizing preservation of legal & human rights
- Privacy
- Supporting exercise of human & legal rights

Person-Centered Planning & Coordination
- Assessment
- Coordination
- Person-centered planning

Service Delivery and Effectiveness
- Delivery
- Person's identified goals realized
- Person's needs met

System Performance & Accountability
- Data management and use
- Evidence-based practice
- Financing and service delivery structures

Workforce
- Adequately compensated with benefits
- Culturally competent
- Demonstrated competencies when appropriate
- Person-centered approach to services
- Safety of and respect for the worker
- Workforce engagement and participation
- Sufficient workforce numbers dispersion and availability
EMPLOYMENT

Number in Employment and Day Services

Source: ICI National Survey of State IDD Agency Day and Employment Services

- Non-work: 610,188
- Facility-based work: 312,448
- Integrated employment: 610,188

Think Work!
State Employment Snapshot: New York

How many individuals participate in integrated employment services provided by the state intellectual and developmental disability agency?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>United States</th>
<th>Ohio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total in day and employment services</td>
<td>638,568</td>
<td>35,948</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total in integrated employment services</td>
<td>120,244</td>
<td>8,909</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% in Integrated Employment</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From: [https://www.statedata.info/statepages/Ohio](https://www.statedata.info/statepages/Ohio)
Type of setting. Choice. With whom a person lives.

HOME
Children and adults in large state IDD facilities of 16 or more people 1950-2016

Source: RISP - Larson et al, 2018
7,374,402 (est.) people in the U.S. have IDD (2% of the population)

1,488,732 are on State IDD agency caseloads (20% of the estimated people with IDD)

1,228,700 receive services from State IDD agencies (17% of the estimated people with IDD)
% people who live outside their family homes with 3 or fewer people and 6 or fewer people with IDD FY 2016

* Imputed values for 1-3 and 4-6 proportions based on national estimates.
Chose Home

The proportion of people who make choices about their everyday lives, including: housing, roommates, daily routines, jobs, support staff or providers, what to spend money on, and social activities.

![Bar chart showing the proportion of people who made choices about their everyday lives in 2014-15.](chart)

- **Someone Else Chose**: 30%
- **Person Had Some Input**: 25%
- **Person Made the Choice**: 45%

**Total Respondents**: 224

**State(s)**: OH
**Chose Roommates**

The proportion of people who make choices about their everyday lives, including housing, roommates, daily routines, jobs, support staff or providers, what to spend money on, and social activities.

- **2014-15**
  - Someone Else Chose: 37%
  - Person Chose Some People or Had Some Input: 13%
  - Person Made the Choice or Chose to Live Alone: 51%

*Total Respondents: 223*
Chose Staff 2012-13 and beyond

The proportion of people who make choices about their everyday lives, including: housing, roommates, daily routines, jobs, support staff or providers, what to spend money on, and social activities.

- Someone Else Chooses: 29%
- Person Has Help or Has Set Limits: 41%
- Person Chooses: 30%

Total Respondents: 378

RELATIONSHIPS AND SELF-DETERMINATION
Uses a Self-Directed Supports Option

The proportion of people who are currently using a self-directed supports option.

Total Respondents: 457
State(s): OH
Chooses Daily Schedule

The proportion of people who make choices about their everyday lives, including: housing, roommates, daily routines, jobs, support staff or providers, what to spend money on, and social activities.

Total Respondents: 444

State(s): OH
Ohio 2015

Chooses What to Buy with His/Her Spending Money

The proportion of people who make choices about their everyday lives, including: housing, roommates, daily routines, jobs, support staff or providers, what to spend money on, and social activities.

- 8% Someone Else Chooses
- 17% Person Has Help or Has Set Limits
- 75% Person Chooses

Total Respondents: 450
State(s): OH
DSP recruitment and retention: A self-advocate perspective

We want staff who show up on time and help us get the stuff done we need to get done.

We want people who are paid enough to stay so they like what they are doing.

We want people who respect us and are respected for what they do and the pay they earn.

Cliff Poetz, Advocacy Leader

Source: IMPACT 2008
Who are we talking about?

• Direct Support Professionals
  – Personal Care Attendant
  – direct care worker
  – direct support staff
  – community living specialist
  – job coach
  – employment specialist
  – ETC…..
### Largest Occupational Groups in the US, 2020

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>Number of Workers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Direct-care workers</td>
<td>4,999,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail salespersons</td>
<td>4,968,400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers, K-12th grades</td>
<td>3,902,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Law enforcement &amp; public safety officers</td>
<td>3,667,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cashiers</td>
<td>3,612,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fast food &amp; counter workers</td>
<td>3,553,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Registered Nurses</td>
<td>3,449,300</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© 2012, PHI

www.PHInational.org
Number of DSPs in U.S. 2016

- Nursing Homes: 602,630
- Independent Providers: 800,000
- Other Industries: 1,572,290
- Home Care: 1,574,780
- Total: 4,549,700
LTSS and U.S. economy 2007-2017

- 1 million+ direct care jobs (54% growth)
- 1 in 6 new jobs in U.S. was in LTSS
- 4/5 new jobs were in home care

Projected growth of workforce 2016-2026 (BLS)

- Other Industries: 2026 - 2,169,700, 2016 - 1,863,300
- Nursing Home: 2026 - 607,900, 2016 - 603,700
- Home Care: 2026 - 3,003,900, 2016 - 1,970,900
- Total: 2026 - 5,781,500, 2016 - 4,437,900

Projected Aging of the Direct-Care Workforce, 2010-2020

U.S.

- Ages 16-34: 39% (2010) to 38% (2020)
- Ages 35-54: 36% (2020)
- Ages 55 and older: 23% (2010) to 28% (2020)

© 2012, PHI
www.PHInational.org
Age of DSPs in U.S. (2015 ACS)

percent by age

- 16-24: 17%
- 25-34: 21%
- 35-44: 21%
- 45-54: 18%
- 55-64: 21%
- 65+: 7%

DSP educational attainment in U.S. (2015 ACS)

- 34% high school
- 33% AS or higher
- 19% some college, no degree
- 14% less than high school

Demographics of DSPs in Ohio (2015 ACS)?

- 90% women
- Race, ethnicity, linguistic diversity
  - 65% white
  - 30% black or African American
  - 3% Hispanic or Latino
  - 3% other
- 40% rely on public assistance
  - 29% food and nutrition
  - 23% Medicaid
- Poverty
  - 85% live <400% federal poverty level
  - 72% live <300%
  - 51% live <200%
  - 21% live <100%

National employment status (2015 ACS)

Home care
- 68% part-time (PT)
- 32% full-time (FT)

Nursing home
- 53% part-time (PT)
- 47% full-time (FT)
DSP Staffing Ratio in Ohio

- Total people served across program types:
  - HCBS: 57,782
  - ICF: 11,902

- DSPs on payroll as of 12/31/16:
  - HCBS: 39,336
  - ICF: 10,889

Staffing Ratio:
- HCBS: 0.68
- ICF: 0.91

Source: NCI staff stability 2016
Is there a crisis?

A crisis (from the Greek κρίσις - *krisis*[^1] plural: "crises"; adjectival form: "critical") is any event that is going (or is expected) to lead to an unstable and dangerous situation affecting an individual, group, community, or whole society. Crises are deemed to be negative changes in the security, economic, political, societal, or environmental affairs, especially when they occur abruptly, with little or no warning. More loosely, it is a term meaning "a testing time" or an "emergency event".

---

**Definition of CRISIS**

plural crises  
\krɛɪs\n
1. a : the turning point for better or worse in an acute disease or fever  
b : a paroxysmal attack of pain, distress, or disordered function  
c : an emotionally significant event or radical change of status in a person's life • a midlife crisis

2. a : the decisive moment (as in a literary plot) • The crisis of the play occurs in Act 3.

3. a : an unstable or crucial time or state of affairs in which a decisive change is impending; especially : one with the distinct possibility of a highly undesirable outcome • a financial crisis • the nation's energy crisis  
b : a situation that has reached a critical phase • the environmental crisis • the unemployment crisis
This is NOT a new issue......for 25+ years.....

Root of DSP workforce challenges

- **No** good planning
- Departments of Labor allowed “off the hook”
- Changing demographics
  - Aging of Americans
  - Fewer younger Americans
- Shifts in laws and expectations
Other factors influencing reality

• Growth # of People with ID/DD Receive Services
  – 390% increase in last 2 decades
• People with IDD live longer (age 66)
• Growing diversity
• Economic stability and growth
DSP workforce reality is a public health crisis

- **Primary public health concern** due to:
  - size of the workforce and increases in demand to support need
  - support provided is essential to the health, safety and overall well-being of seniors, people with disabilities
  - substandard work conditions undermine the ability to recruit and retain DSWs threatening the future supply

Workforce conditions that deter entry into the profession

- Low wages
- Meager benefits
- Physically challenging work (high rate of injury)
- High accountability for actions
- Isolation from other workers and supervisors
- Lack of a career ladder
- Insufficient training and professional development
SNAPSHOT OF DIRECT SUPPORT WORKFORCE CHALLENGES IN THE UNITED STATES (NCI, 2018)

Of the 224,818 DSPs employed in the 2,364 reporting organizations:

- 34% were part-time
- 66% were full-time

There was variance by state ranging from 23% - 74% of the DSP workforce being part-time.

46% state average turnover rate for DSPs

- 24% Range state average turnover rate for DSPs 69%

Of DSPs who left positions in calendar year 2016:

- 38% left in fewer than 6 months
- 21% left between 6 and 12 months
- 41% left after 12 months

Of DSPs employed within these organizations:

- 19% have been there fewer than 6 months
- 16% between 6 and 12 months
- 65% over 12 months
15% of responding providers offer health insurance to all DSPs

66% of responding providers offer health insurance to only full-time DSPs

17% of responding providers do not offer health insurance

Average wages:
- Starting average: $10.79
- Overall average: $11.76

Wage ranges:
- Starting: $8.79 - $13.87
- Overall: $9.47 - $14.27

Vacancy rates:
- Average vacancy:
  - Part-time: 15%
  - Full-time: 10%
  - Overall: 12%

Vacancy ranges:
- Part-time: 5 - 28%
- Full-time: 4 - 15%
- Overall: 5 - 12%

States: AL, AZ, CT, DC, GA, HI, IL, IN, MD, MO, NE, NY, OH, OR, PA, SC, SD, TN, TX, UT, VT
DSP Separation and Turnover in Ohio

DSPs separated in last 12 months

- HCBS: 19,977
- ICF/IID: 7,521

DSP turnover

- HCBS: 51%
- ICF/IID: 69%

Source: NCI staff stability 2016
Timing of DSP Separation in Ohio

Timing of DSP Separation

- Separated DSPs leaving in <6mo: 48% (HCBS) 15% (ICF/IID)
- Separated DSPs leaving in 6-12 mos: 21% (HCBS) 17% (ICF/IID)
- Separated DSPs leaving in 12+: 31% (HCBS) 33% (ICF/IID)

Source: NCI staff stability 2016
DSP Vacancy Rates in Ohio

DSP Vacancy Rates

- **Full time vacancy rates**
  - HCBS: 9%
  - ICF/IID: 12%

- **Part time vacancy rates**
  - HCBS: 13%
  - ICF/IID: 21%

Source: NCI staff stability 2016
DSP Tenure in Ohio

Source: NCI staff stability 2016
DSP Wages in Ohio

Source: NCI staff stability 2016

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>HCBS</th>
<th>ICF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>wages all DSPs average</td>
<td>$11.16</td>
<td>$11.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wages all DSPs range</td>
<td>$8.10</td>
<td>$8.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>starting wage average</td>
<td>$10.00</td>
<td>$9.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>starting wage range</td>
<td>$7.25</td>
<td>$8.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>residential average</td>
<td>$9.71</td>
<td>$9.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in home average</td>
<td>$9.84</td>
<td>$9.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>non residential</td>
<td>$10.62</td>
<td>$10.04</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: NCI staff stability 2016
United States: Median Hourly Wages for Direct-Care Care Workers, 2005 - 2015

Adjusted for Inflation (2015 dollars)

DSP = HHA + PCA + CAN + a whole lot more!!

Source: PHI National.org
Ohio DSP wages over time (2016 BLS)

Wage growth
- PCA: -$0.09
- HHA: -$1.00
- NA: -$0.84
- Total: -$1.08

Direct-Care Worker Median Hourly Wage Comparison, 2011

U.S.

- Parking Enforcement Workers: $16.99
- Refuse & Recycling Collectors: $15.52
- Nursing Aides, Orderlies, & Attendants: $11.63
- Home Health Aides: $9.91
- Personal Care Aides: $9.49

© 2012, PHI
Low wages:
Correlation of entry wage to turnover

Source: 2009 DSP Wage Study, ANCOR
Wages matter...
WY 2002 DSP wage pass-through

WAGES ARE IMPORTANT BUT......
They aren’t the only thing

- Of all staff who leave
  - 45% leave in first 6 months
  - 23% leave between 6-12 months
- 15% of new hires fired in the first year

- Reasons for leaving
  - Co-workers
  - Pay or benefits
  - Supervisors

Larson, Lakin, Bruininks, 1998
# Ohio DSP health insurance (2015 ACS)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Health insurance status</th>
<th>Home care</th>
<th>Nursing home</th>
<th>total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Any health insurance coverage</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>81%</td>
<td>79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employer/union</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medicaid, Medicare, other public</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchased directly</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

DSP Health Insurance Benefits in Ohio

Health Insurance Benefits

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>HCBS</th>
<th>ICF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>8.5%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>43.0%</td>
<td>71.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>45.9%</td>
<td>3.1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: NCI staff stability 2016
DSP benefits in New York

- 91.8% offer paid sick leave for FT DSPs
- 83% offer paid vacation for FT DSPs
- 94.6% offer health insurance to FT DSPs
  - Only 41.9% of DSPs enrolled in health plans
  - Average $96.94 for monthly premium payments for *individual* coverage (range $0.00 to $562.00).
  - 2-person average monthly payment was $241.26 (range from $0.00 to $1,060.23).
  - *family* average payment was $385.24 (range from $0.00 to $1,568.00).

(Hewitt et al., 2015)
DSP Pooled Time Off in Ohio

Pooled Time Off

Source: NCI staff stability 2016

HCBS

ICF
DSP Paid Time Off in Ohio

Paid Time Off

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>HCBS</th>
<th>ICF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>6.40%</td>
<td>9.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>20.90%</td>
<td>45.50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>63.60%</td>
<td>45.50%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: NCI staff stability 2016
| Source: NCI staff stability 2016 |

| DSP Health Insurance Benefits in Ohio | 8.5% | 43.0% | 0% | 45.9% | 24.5% | 71.4% | 0% | 3.1% |
NY FLS salary

- Average starting salary $33,598
- Average salary $38,690
- Average highest salary $50,156

**These data do not include two 2% wage increases that occurred on January 1, 2015 and April 1, 2015.**

(Hewitt et al., 2015)
U.S. unemployment rate over time, 2007–2017
Three primary advocacy messages past 30 years....

1. DSPs deserve increase wages because they do critical and important work for vulnerable citizens.
2. Private sector DSPs deserve increased wages because it is unfair that they make on average $2-3/hr less than DSPs who work in public run facilities.
3. Increase provider rates so they can increase wages.
Consequences of Crisis
Families

• Worried about access and quality
• Unable to keep jobs or accept promotions
• Family member at home longer
• Stress and related health issues
Direct Support Professionals

- High stress/burnout
- Working 2-3 jobs
- Injury
- Poverty
- Poor health outcomes
Isolated and alone
High expectation discrepancy

- Specialized knowledge
- Comply with rules and regulations
- Document
- Teach
- End shift neat & tidy
- Maintain health & safety
- Work well with others
- Support choice
- Respect rights
- Problem-solve
- Medical support
- Person-centered
- Culturally competent

Teach
Organizations

- Focus on getting people in
  - Lowering expectations of qualifications
- Supervisors in crisis management vs mentoring and supervision
- Risks and high costs of injury
  - Employees
  - People supported
NY DSP shortage effect

• Delay, deny or limit services to prospective new individuals
  – 33% yes

(Hewitt et al, 2015)
Impact of staff turnover on UMN intervention implementation studies

- Active Support (Larson, Ticha & Qian, 2014)
- Self-Determination (Abery & Ticha, 2014)
- Comprehensive Training (Hewitt, Nord & Bogenshutz, 2014)
- Participatory Planning and Decision Making Group (PPDM) (Abery, Ticha & Qian, 2015)
Wasted Resources
NY overtime (past 30 days)

* Note – average DSP wage 12.74 + OT 6.37 = $19.11 average OT hourly rate
$48,559 month in OT expenditures = $582,702 annually per org; across 354 orgs = $206,276,508.
Just the half-time extra per hour is $194,234 annually per org; across 354 orgs = $68,758,836. ($1,240 per DSP)
Estimated replacement costs related to turnover – U.S.

- 1,276,000 DSPs (est)
- Estimated costs to replace each DSP $4,073
- 574,200 are replaced each year (45% turnover)
- Costs = $2,338,716,600
  - Roughly $2,000 per DSP ($1 per hour)

Source: PCPID, 2018
Many solutions to consider
Building & strengthening the DSP workforce

- **Recruitment & selection**
  - Targeted Marketing
  - Realistic Job Previews
  - Structured Interviewing
  - Status and Awareness (PSAs)

- **Retention**
  - DSW Competencies
  - Education and Training
  - Credentialing and Career Paths
  - Recognition
  - Membership and Networking

- **Implementation levels**
  - Organization
  - Systems
  - Societal
Emerging evidence based of interventions that help!

- **Kansans Mobilizing for Change (Larson & Hewitt, 2004)**
  - 12 organizations
  - Training on toolkit with RJP, marketing materials, on-line training, org assessment
  - 15% reduction in DSP turnover
  - 29% reduction in FLS turnover
  - Vacancy went from 3.1% in 200 to 2.4% in 2004

- **Removing the Revolving Door (Hewitt, Keiling & Sauer, 2008)**
  - 14 organizations 2004-2008
  - 13 of 15 organizations 1 year of reduced turnover; 5 had 2 yrs; 4 had 3 years and 2 across all 4 years
  - All experience FLS turnover reduction

- **National Technical Assistance and Training Initiative for FLSs (Taylor, Larson, Hewitt, McCulloh, & Sauer, 2007)**
  - 8 providers across 5 states
  - Train the trainer on assessment and mapping to intervention
  - Reduction in DSP turnover of 40% across orgs and FLS in 4/6

- **Randomized controlled comprehensive training study (Hewitt, Nord & Bogenshutz, 2015)**
  - 11 organizations
  - Comprehensive hybrid training model linked to desired outcomes
  - DSP turnover reduced by 16.4% over 12 month period

Biggest challenge = sustaining and scaling up
10 Strategies for Success

1. Recruit the Right Staff
2. Improve the Hiring Process
3. Strengthen Entry-Level Training
4. Provide Employment Supports
5. Promote Peer Support
6. Ensure Effective Supervision
7. Develop Advancement Opportunities
8. Invite Participation
9. Recognize and Reward Staff
10. Measure Progress
DSP Recruitment and Retention Strategies in Ohio

Recruitment and retention strategies

RJP: Realistic Job Preview

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>HCBS</th>
<th>ICF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: NCI staff stability 2016
Systems Level Solutions to Consider
DSP scope of practice - multidisciplinary

- Direct Support Professional
- Teacher
- Nurse
- Psychologist
- Occupational therapist
- Physical therapist
- Counselor
- Dietitian
- Chauffeur
- Personal trainer
Learn, Lead, Love

THE JOURNEY TOWARD EXCELLENCE IN DIRECT SUPPORT
Changing our messages

- **Why DSPs matter** – Chumie Twerski
- **The ultimate goal of direct support** – John Raffaele
Consistent workforce data

- **Number of DSPs**
  - PT/FT/relief or temporary
- **Demographics**
  - Basics
  - Retirement age
- **Wages**
- **Benefits**
  - Taken up
- **Crude Separation**
  - Before 6 months
- **Average tenure**
- **Vacancies**
- **Overtime paid in last 30 days**
- **Waiting lists, denials and authorized vs delivered services**
- **Frontline supervisor**
  - Number
  - Demographics
  - Wages
  - Crude separation
  - Vacancies
- **Differences by**
  - FT/PT and temp status
  - Setting type
    - Individual characteristics
  - Service type
  - Provider
  - Zip Code
- **Costs of recruitment, selection and on boarding**
  - Marketing
  - Advertising
  - Interviewing
  - Selection process
  - Background checks
  - Replacement DSP costs
  - Training delivery and time
  - Admin
- **Ratio # people served to people served**
- **Qualitative stories where a DSP changed a life and saved money**
Importance of DATA

• Legislative advocacy
• Accuracy in separating information DSP who with certain populations or types of services
• Make informed policy and practice decisions
• Create wage scales within organizations
• Other reasons?.......
Can you answer these key questions (for your site, org or state)?

- What is your DSP turnover rate (crude separation)?
- What is your vacancy rate for DSPs? # of vacancies?
- What 3 issues most influence your retention rates?
- What specific recruitment and selection interventions do you use and what changes have they made in your data?
- What percentage of you DSP are fired and why?
- What are reasons DSPs leave?
- What are the FLS turnover rates (crude separation)? What is your vacancy rate for DSPs? # of vacancies?
- How much are you spending each month in overtime expenses (extra 50% only)?
- What is the average number of hours of training your DSPs receive during orientation? Annually thereafter?
- What are three characteristics of your most successful DSPs?
- What are your best and worst performing sites related to DSP turnover and vacancy rates?
- What are the best things about your organizational culture and the most toxic?
Calculating crude separation, tenure and other....

Web link to data brief with instructions
https://ici.umn.edu/products/docs/TurnoverCalculator.pdf
Service model redesign

- Shared living
- Independent contractors
- DSP worker cooperatives
- Self-directed service expansion
  - Direct Support Workforce Registries and Matching Services

“My Self-Directed Life

“I choose self-directed services because I want to live my life my way,” says Santa Perez.
Community and family as focus of interventions and services

• Putting faith to work
• Social inclusion: A community intervention
• Retirement
• Targeted focused work with diverse communities
  – Community liaisons
• Direct support professionals providing direct intervention and support with communities
  – Businesses
  – faith communities
  – recreational programs
  – adult education)
New Technology Means New Options for People Needing Supports

- Sensors
- Remote Monitoring
- Computer-Assisted Devices (Tablets, Smartphones)
- Transportation Technologies
- Electronic Medication Dispensers
- Smart Homes
- Personal Robots and Assistants

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SrO8ksow8Bo
Expanded workforce pipeline

- High school students
- Immigrants and expanded cultural, ethnic and linguistic diversity
- Retirees

“IT’S NOT JUST A PAYING JOB SOMEDAY; IT’S AN OPPORTUNITY, EVERY DAY, TO IMPACT AND CHANGE SOMEONE’S LIFE IN A GOOD WAY.” — VICTORIA
DSP training + education + careers

- Competency Based Training
- Credentialing and Career Paths
Competency-based training and education

- **Knowledge**: What do I need to know? What theories or ideas?
- **Skills & Abilities**: What do I need to be able to do?
- **Behaviors**: What dispositions must I display?
- **Application & Transfer**: Where must I be able to apply these KSAs, and at what level?

Focus on what’s needed to be successful - outcomes.

Source: Charla Long, 2017
Outcomes Associated with Competency-Based Training

- Increased DSW Competence
- Higher Job Satisfaction
- Higher Retention Rates
- Quality Service Delivery
- Quality Consumer Outcomes

Competency-Based DSW Training
DSP competency sets 1996 - 2014

CSSS 1996
Community Support Skill Standards

Hewitt 1998
IDD Residential Core

NADSP 2002
National Alliance for Direct Support Professionals Core Competencies

APSE 2011
Association of People Supporting Employment First

DOL LTSS 2012
Department of Labor Long-Term Services and Supports Core Competencies

FLS 2013
National Frontline Supervisor Core Competencies

NADD 2014
National Association of Dual Diagnosis Competency-Based Direct Support Certification

CMS 2014
Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services DSP Core Competencies

The NADSP Competency Areas: The Foundation of the Work

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Competency Area</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Area 1</td>
<td>Participant Empowerment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area 2</td>
<td>Communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area 3</td>
<td>Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area 4</td>
<td>Community and Service Networking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area 5</td>
<td>Facilitation of Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area 6</td>
<td>Community Living Skills and Supports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area 7</td>
<td>Education, Training, and Self Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area 8</td>
<td>Advocacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area 9</td>
<td>Vocational, Educational, and Career Support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area 10</td>
<td>Crisis Prevention and Intervention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area 11</td>
<td>Organizational Participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area 12</td>
<td>Documentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area 13</td>
<td>Building and Maintaining Friendships and Relationships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area 14</td>
<td>Person-Centered Supports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Area 15</td>
<td>Supporting Health and Wellness</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Based on NADSP (2018).
Scales are tipped severely in the wrong direction

240+ hours minimally needed to meet basics

40+ hours provided

Balance is achieved when Training → competence
Competency based training matters

ONE YEAR

Baseline Survey → Supplemental Training → DSP Study Training → Post Survey

Baseline Survey → Regular Training → Post Survey

Hewitt, Nord, Bogenschutz, 2013
## Align training with outcomes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Direct Support Professional: MODULE</th>
<th>Individual with Disability: OUTCOME</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Professionalism</td>
<td>Satisfaction with Staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Inclusion</td>
<td>Community Inclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Person Centered Planning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Rights and Choice</td>
<td>Choices &amp; Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil Rights and Advocacy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety at Home and in the Community</td>
<td>Health &amp; Safety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Healthy Lives</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Care</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You’ve Got a Friend</td>
<td>Friends &amp; Family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment Supports</td>
<td>Work, Day, and Home</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home and Community Living</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Care</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Intervention: training approach

• Online training: College of Direct Support
  ▪ 35 lessons over 12 months
  ▪ 6 modules address different topics
  ▪ Pre/post-test measures

• Mentoring
  ▪ Supervisor or advanced DSP
  ▪ Mentoring on each module topic

• Group discussion
  ▪ With peers and supervisors
  ▪ Provided for each module
Comprehensive training study

• Findings
  • Intervention sites experience 16.4% decrease in turnover after one year
  • DSPs showed increased competence (Rights & Choice, Health & Safety, Relationships)
  • DSPs showed increased satisfaction with supervisors
  • Individuals who received services had improved outcomes in all areas

Hewitt, Nord & Bogenshutz, UMN Comprehensive Training Study, 2014
People with Disabilities
(N = 140 from 9 organizations)

Among the promising trends:

• Across both settings—intervention group experienced:
  – Decreases in loneliness compared to increases with control group.
  – Greater proportion reporting best friends compared to a decrease in control group.
  – Greater increase in social roles than control group.
  – Greater increase in choice making compared to control group.

RTC, 2013 (preliminary data)
NY recommended components of a credential structure

Word-based learning approaches (internships, mentoring, etc.)
Funding
Accessible programming: physically & academically
Provide support for learner success
“Hybrid” instructional model onsite and online
Wage and promotion incentives

Source: Hewitt, Kramme, & Taylor, 2016
Career GEAR Up
Growth, Education, Advancement, and Respect

DSP Credential I
50 Hours

DSP Credential II
100 Hours

DSP Credential III (Mentor)
40 Hours

Frontline Supervisor & Management
40 Hours

Key Design Elements of the New York Direct Support Professional (DSP) Credentialing Model

1. Multi-tiered credential with a hybrid model of learning methods. The Credentials must be achieved in sequence, beginning with DSP Credential I. Proposed training opportunities include on-line training, interactive classroom learning and work-based learning opportunities —
   a. DSP Credential I includes 50 hours of training: 20 hours on-line, 10 hours classroom training, and 20 hours of work-based learning
   b. DSP Credential II includes 100 hours of training: 40 hours on-line, 20 hours classroom training, and 40 hours of work-based learning

2. Valid, recognized competency-based skills and knowledge requirements. These are the identified outcomes that will be assessed across the credential program. The competencies used as the basis of the credentialing program are —
   a. New York State DSP Core Competency Goals
      • Putting people first
      • Building & maintaining positive relationships
      • Demonstrating professionalism
      • Supporting good health
      • Supporting safety
      • Having a home
      • Being active and productive in society
2017 OPWDD Comparative Analysis of Credentialing Programs in New York State
Credential programs included

- Wildwood Programs
  - Conover Scholars
- Arc of Orange County
  - NADSP (four cohorts)
- Arc of Monroe
  - NADSP (first cohort)
- Arc of Ulster-Greene
  - NADSP (three cohorts)
- Training Collaborative
  - NADSP - Supervisor
Arc of Ulster Green 2017 NASDP credential cohort
Positive outcomes

- Stronger understanding and application of person-centered practices
- DSPs feeling more competence in performing their work
- DSPs attending planning meetings (finding that it is important to deliver quality supports)
- Higher wages after completion of credential
- Longer retention; less turnover of credentialed staff
- More competition for credential program spots after about three years implementation

(OPWDD, 2018)
Credential in Ohio
7 Key Tenets of TN QuILTSS

- Competency-Based
- Require Demonstration
- Micro-Credentialing System
- Portability through Registry
- Faculty, Coach and Mentor Supported
- Clear Career and College Pathways
- Credit-Bearing Framework

Source:
Charla Long, 2017
Dear Gov. Cuomo,
We serve New Yorkers with developmental disabilities. We seek a living wage. State lawmakers are with us.

Governor, please say yes.
#bFair2DirectCare

Everyone can help.
Call Gov. Cuomo (212) 681-458

Follow us:
@Fair2DirectCare &
facebook.com/BFair2DirectCare

Speaking Out for DSP Wages in New York: The #bFair2DirectCare Campaign

https://z.umn.edu/bfair2directcare
Marketing and public relations campaigns

- Coalition for a living wage (NJ)
  - njdspcoalition.org
- Fix the crisis (PA)
  - Fixthedspcrisis.com
- We are DSPs – Raise the Wage (IL)
  - Wearedsp.com
- The Case for DSP Wage Increases (IN)
  - Stonebelt.org/direct-support-professional-wages-need-to-increase
- National advocacy campaign (ANCOR)
  - Nationaladvocacycampaign.org
PSA – public service announcements

- Component of recruitment campaign
- Raise community awareness of DSPs
- Celebrate profession
- Combine with annual DSP national week

ANCOR PSAs –
http://www.nationaladvocacycampaign.org/toolkit/future-dsp

NYSACRA PSAs –
http://www.directsupportprofessional.org/
Who knows DSPs?

• Purposeful actions
  – your organization
  – other businesses

• EVERYONE in community knows DSPs
  – who, what and where

• How?
  – Neighborhood bar-b-ques that focus on the DSPs
  – Get to know me cards on doors
  – Media interviews
  – Celebrity spokespeople who celebrate DSPs
Organization Level
Solutions to Consider
Building & Strengthening the DSP Workforce

• Recruitment & Selection
  – Targeted Marketing
  – Realistic Job Previews
  – Structured Interviewing
  – Status and Awareness (PSAs)

• Retention
  – DSW Competencies
  – Education and Training
  – Credentialing and Career Paths
  – Recognition
  – Membership and Networking

There is not a single solution!
Business Acumen – systematically use tools that work

• Targeted Marketing
• Structured Behavioral Interview Questions and Interviewers Guide
• National Frontline Supervisor Competencies (NFSC) [link]
• Customized and Branded Public Service Announcements (PSAs)
• Customized Realistic Job Previews (RJPs)
• Recruitment bonuses
Workplace Culture

DRIVES or DRAGS

DSP Performance

Culture is only as good as the people decide it should be. Culture is the medium which holds the mission in its hands and determines its success.

Regis Obijiski is an Executive Coach and former Director of Workforce Transformation, New York State Office for People with Developmental Disabilities, Albany, and retired Executive Director, New Horizons Resources, Inc. in New York's Hudson Valley.
Organizational culture

• Intentional learning
• Leader who knows the direct line staff by name
  • Goes out of their way to engage
  • Periodically practices direct support
  • Celebrates DSPs
• Individual story-driven
• Data-driven
  • Makes data driven decisions regarding workforce
  • Monitoring is routine
• Engages DSPs at all levels
Creating a competitive edge

- Organization culture is your competitive edge
- It takes a lot of effort and work to create an organizational culture that supports DSP
- “DSP week” is 52 weeks a year!
Organizational culture is 1 of 4 “biggies”

Know who your workforce is and support it

On the first day of employment with OHI, each new person is informed that if he/she is engaged in a financial struggle, the Human Resources manager is available to provide assistance.

Bonnie-Jean Brooks is President and CEO, OHI, Hermon, Maine.
Workforce development toolkits

- **ANCOR**
  - [http://www.nationaladvocacycampaign.org/welcome](http://www.nationaladvocacycampaign.org/welcome)

- **The Arc of the United States**
  - [https://www.thearc.org/for-chapters/dsp-toolkit](https://www.thearc.org/for-chapters/dsp-toolkit)

- **Find, Choose and Keep Great DSPs (self-direction)**
The DSP workforce tools

- Targeted Marketing Flyers & Job Announcements
- Ready-made PSA’s
- Realistic Job Preview for DPS’s
- Structural Behavior Interview Guide for Hiring DSP’s
Realistic Job Previews

**Who**
- Potential Recruits
- Job Candidates

**When**
- Job Fairs
- Recruiting Events
- Workforce One Stop Centers
- Early in interview Process
Benefits of Realistic Job Previews

- Candidates understand job expectations before they start the job
- Candidates make informed decision
- Candidates can self-select out
RJP’s improve retention rates by 9% - 17%
RJP’s increase retention of workers
- 12% for agencies with annual retention rates of 50%, and
- 24% for agencies with annual retention rates of 20%
Realistic Job Preview

ANCOR RJP -

NYSACRA RJP –
http://www.directsupportprofessional.org/
Realistic Job Previews

Present non-distorted information to job applicants
  • about the job
  • and the organization/family/individual(s)
  • before a job offer has been made
Use inside recruitment sources

Inside sources:

- current employees
  - Referral bonuses
- people receiving services and their families or friends
- volunteers
- social media networks that are existing “friends” of the organization
- staff friends
- service coordinators or case managers
- board members
- others…..

Outside sources:

- newspaper advertisements
- internet ads
  - Craig’s list
  - Linked in
- fliers regarding open positions
- job boards and placement offices in high schools and colleges
- others?
Selecting the best candidates

The process used to assure a good match between

- The APPLICANT…with the right
  - Competencies and Skills
  - Attitudes and Values
  - Interest in and Commitment to do the job

- The ORGANIZATION…with its
  - Job Requirements and Expectations
  - Culture and Climate
  - Investment with employees
Know your stayers

- What does the data you gather tell you about who stays longest in your organization?
- Who are your best employees?
- Where can you gain access to more people with similar characteristics?
- How are you marketing and recruiting to find their clones?
Customizable marketing materials

New community = New opportunities

You’ve got a diploma, now what?

Don’t stop working. Work with someone new!

Become a Direct Support Professional
Work as a Direct Support Professional and support people to live valued lives in the community. Use the skills you have and expand your opportunities.

To explore more please visit theArc.org/dsp

Become a Direct Support Professional
Find your passion in life, discover the opportunities ahead of you. Work with people who need you by becoming a Direct Support Professional.

To explore more please visit theArc.org/dsp

Become a Direct Support Professional
Direct Support Professionals work with people who need support and help them learn necessary skills for life.

To explore more please visit theArc.org/dsp
Use structured behavioral interviews

• The best predictor of future behavior is past behavior in similar circumstances that was recent or that reflected long-standing behavior patterns

• Ask candidates to describe situations they have faced and how they handled them

• Situation, Behavior, Outcome

• Based on NADSP Competency Areas
Structured behavioral interviews

Sample Questions:

Competency area 1: PARTICIPANT EMPOWERMENT
Describe a situation when you assisted an individual to recognize that he or she had several choices in how to handle a difficult problem. What was the situation, what did you do, and what was the final outcome?

Competency area 4: COMMUNITY & SERVICE NETWORKING
Please describe some community resources you have had contact with in your own neighborhood. How might those resources be used by a person with a disability?
"When I am facing the most difficult challenges, I turn to the factory and I always find solutions there."

- Hamdi Ulukaya
Know what your DSPs see and think

- Ask them, be on the pulse
  - Informal talking sessions with leadership
  - Engagement survey
  - Focused conversation at staff meeting with supervisors
  - Text with simple question
Focus on frontline supervisors

• DSP turnover is lower when
  • DSPs feel valued
  • DSPs feel they are treated fairly

• Reasons DSPs leave
  • issues with co-workers
  • issues with supervisors

Source: Larson, 1997
FLS wages are not great and turnover is high

New York data

• **FLS wages**
  – Average starting salary was $34,956.06 ($16.80/hr)
  – Average FLS salary was $40,253.54 ($19.35/hr)
  – Average highest FLS salary was $52,183.12 ($25.08/hr)

• **FLS turnover**
  – Average **FLS turnover rate** was 13.0% (ranged from 0 to 50%)
  – Average **FLS vacancy rate** for the entire sample was 5.3% (range from 0 to 33.3%).

(Hewitt et. al., 2015)
Where are FLS new hires recruited?

- 42% promotion of existing employees
- 17% websites such as Craig’s List
- 10% referrals given by current employees
- 9% newspaper or circular ads
- 1% private employment or temporary staffing agencies
- 1% school or training placement programs
- 1% social media such as LinkedIn and Facebook
- 5% came from other sources
- (14% did not track this information)
National frontline supervisor competencies

1. Direct Support
2. Health, Wellness, & Safety
3. Individual Support Plan Development, Monitoring, and Assessment
4. Facilitating Community Inclusion Across the Lifespan
5. Promoting Professional Relations and Teamwork
6. Staff Recruitment, Selection, and Hiring
7. Staff Supervision, Training and Development
8. Quality Assurance
9. Advocacy & Public Relations
10. Leadership, Professionalism, & Self-Development
11. Cultural Responsiveness & Awareness
Supporting frontline supervisors

• Use evidence based Frontline Supervisor Competencies that reflect best practice in current service system.

• Use on-line workforce development tools utilizing these competencies, including:
  • candidate assessment tool
  • peer assessment
  • selection tool
  • training and development tool
  • performance evaluation
Implement strategies to increase effectiveness of remote supervision

- Communicate frequently and listen
  - Use technology
  - Staff-centered communication approach
    - Phone, text, e-mail
- Communicate accountabilities and follow up often
- Use animated gifs and emoticons to convey emotion
- Provide right tools
- Insist on some face-to-face that is not all business (not staff meetings)
  - Network focused
  - Relationship building
- Make time weekly for one-to-one
- Small talk is key
- Use video
  - Skype
  - Google Hangouts
  - Sqwiggle
Professional Identify and Recognition
Making a world of difference in people’s lives

VISION STATEMENT
A world with a highly qualified and professional direct support workforce that partners with, supports and empowers people with disabilities to lead a life of their choosing.

MISSION STATEMENT
To elevate the status of direct support professionals by improving practice standards, promoting system reform, and advancing their knowledge, skills and values.
The Direct Support Workforce Crisis

A Call to Action

1. Ensure that who DSPs are, what they do and why they are important is known to community members
2. Improve DSP identity, respect and recognition
3. Create an occupational title in BLS
4. Fund use of competency based training models that result in credentialed or certified staff with wage increase
5. Develop industry specific pipeline programs
6. Gather comprehensive data at site, org, state and nat’l levels
7. Provide and use evidence based interventions
8. Promote increased use of self-directed options
9. Increase use of technology-enhanced supports

Source: Amy Hewitt (UMN RTC/CL), Joe MacBeth (NADSP), Barbara Merrill (ANCOR) & Barb Kleist (UMN RTC/CL), 2018
Research and Training Center on Community Living
Institute on Community Integration (UCEDD)
University of Minnesota, Twin Cities
214 Pattee Hall, 150 Pillsbury Drive SE
Minneapolis, MN  55455
hewit005@umn.edu

This research was supported by grant from the National Institute on Disabilities and Rehabilitation Research, U.S. Department of Education #H133G080029 and #H133B080005. Grantees undertaking projects under government sponsorship are encouraged to express freely their findings and conclusions. Points of view or opinions do not, therefore necessarily represent official NIDRR policy.